

PLANNING COMMITTEE

5 June 2013
9.30 am - 2.25 pm

Present: Councillors Stuart (Chair), Blencowe (Vice-Chair), Dryden, Hipkin, Marchant-Daisley, Rosenstiel, Saunders and Tunnacliffe

Also Present: Councillors Ward and Swanson

Councillor Dryden and Marchant-Daisley were not present for the consideration of items 13/33/PLAN5b and 13/34/PLAN

Officers:

Head of Planning Services: Patsy Dell

City Development Manager: Sarah Dyer

Legal Advisor: Cara DeLaMare

Environmental Quality and Growth Manager: Jo Dicks

New Neighbourhoods Principal Planner: Janine Richardson

New Neighbourhoods Development Manager: Sharon Brown

Principal Planning Officer: Toby Williams

Committee Manager: Toni Birkin

FOR THE INFORMATION OF THE COUNCIL**13/29/PLAN Apologies**

No apologies were received.

13/30/PLAN Declarations of Interest

Name	Item	Interest
Councillor Stuart	13/33/PLANb	Personal and Prejudicial: The Applicant was a client of her former employer. Withdrew from the discussion and room and did not vote.
Councillor Stuart	13/32/PLANa	Personal: Member of same political party as applicant.
Councillor	13/32/PLANa	Personal: Member of Cambridge

Rosenstiel		Cycling Campaign Personal: Member of same political party. Personal and Prejudicial: Applicant was a family friend. Withdrew from the discussion and room and did not vote.
Councillor Rosenstiel	13/32/PLANb	Personal: Member of Campaign for Real Ale (but took no part in their debates of this issue).
Councillor Saunders	13/32/PLANb	Personal: Member of Cambridge Cycling Campaign
Councillor Saunders	13/32/PLANb	Personal: Member of Cambridge Past Present and Future
Councillor Saunders	13/32/PLANa	Personal: Member of same political party as applicant.
Councillor Tunnacliffe	13/32/PLANa	Personal: Member of same political party as applicant.

13/31/PLAN Minutes

The minutes of the 1st May 2013 meetings were approved and signed as a correct record.

Change to Published Agenda order

Under paragraph 4.2.1 of the Council Procedure Rules, the Chair used her discretion to alter the order of the agenda items. However, for ease of the reader, these minutes will follow the order of the agenda.

13/32/PLAN Planning Applications

13/32/PLANa Planning Application 15 Bulstrode Gardens 13/0312/FUL

Councillor Rosenstiel withdrew from the meeting for this item and did not participate in the discussion or decision making.

The Committee received an application for retrospective planning permission.

The application sought approval for erection of a bike shed to the front of the house.

The Principal Planning Officer referred to the amendment sheet which added clarity to the reasons for bringing this application to committee and outlined additional representation received.

The Committee received representations in objection to the application from Paul Simm.

The representation covered the following issues:

- i. The structure was against the spirit of the community.
- ii. It was out of character with the area.
- iii. The current street scape was coherent and allowed individuality with a sense of conformity.
- iv. The properties in the area shared a covenant requiring outbuilding to be built to the rear of the property.
- v. Bicycles were not new and most residents owned them and stored them to the rear or side of the property.
- vi. The area was worthy of conservation.
- vii. Neighbours were concerned that this structure would set a precedent.

Mrs Lucy Nethsingha addressed the Committee in support of the application. She apologised for her mistake in not realising the structure required planning permission.

The Committee:

Resolved (by 4 votes to 2 and 1 abstention) to accept the officer recommendation to approve planning permission as per the agenda and subject to a condition to read as follows:

1: Within 3 months from the date of this permission the cycle shed shall be reduced in size to accord with the approved plans.

Reason: In order to reduce the visual prominence of a car parked in front of the shed and extending towards the roadway (Cambridge Local Plan policies 3/4, 4/11)

13/32/PLANb Planning Report Queen Edith Public House 12-1616/FUL

The Committee received an application for full planning permission.

The application sought approval for the demolition of the existing public house and replacement with a new public house including ancillary on bedroom manager's apartment (Use Class 4A) and single two bedroom residential apartment (Use Class C3) above, and a separate block of 12 two-bedroom residential apartments (Use Class C3), with associated access, car parking and landscaping.

The Principal Planning Officer referred to the additional representation noted on the amendment sheet.

The Committee received representations in objection to the application from Paul Treadaway on behalf of the Campaign for Real Ale.

The representation covered the following issues:

- i. A pub on this site was welcomed.
- ii. Original concerns about the size of the beer garden and viability of the plan had been addressed with the improved layout.
- iii. Cycle parking could be improved.

The Committee:

Resolved (unanimously) to accept the officers recommendation to approve planning permission as per the agenda and subject to an amendment to condition 15 and an additional condition 18 relating to the location of cycle parking and disabled parking for the pub.

Amended condition 15 to read:

15: The residential apartments comprised in the development hereby permitted shall not be occupied before the access road, the public house car parking and sewer connection hereby permitted have been completed, and the works required to construct the public house comprised in the development hereby permitted have been completed to at least damp proof course level (DPC) in accordance with the approved drawings and evidence of a contract for the substantial provision of the pub, including a contract to build and a phasing

plan for its provision, has been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The substantial provision of the pub shall thereafter be made in accordance with the approved details unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: In order that the public house is replaced on the site to meet the day-to-day needs of the community, NPPF paragraph 70.

18: Notwithstanding the submitted layout plan, the location of the cycle parking and disabled parking bay associated with the public house shall be relocated to a more accessible position closer to the pub entrance, amended plans of which shall be submitted pursuant to the discharge of condition 12.

Reason: In order to ensure that cycle parking provision is accessible and disabled parking provision is as convenient as possible (Cambridge Local Plan policies 3/4 and 3/7)

13/32/PLANc Planning Report 13/0209/S73 Aldi, Unit 1, 157 Histon Road

The Committee received an application to vary condition 14 of permission C/95/0110 to allow extended delivery hours to 7.00am and 10.00pm Monday to Saturday.

The Senior Planning Officer introduced the report and members noted an email from the applicant in support of the application.

The Committee received a representation from Councillor Ward in his capacity as Ward Councillor for Arbury.

The representation covered the following issues;

- i. The additional hours would disrupt the sleep of residents in nearby properties.

At the request of members, officers supplied additional information regarding the delivery hours of the Iceland Store that share the site with Aldi. These were said to mirror the Aldi conditions. It was confirmed that any change to the permitted delivery hours for Aldi would not apply to Iceland.

The Head of Planning suggested an amendment to the Officer's recommendation in that the variation be granted for a temporary period of one year.

The Committee:

Resolved (by 7 Votes to 1) to accept the officer recommendation to approve the variation of the conditions as per the agenda and subject to a temporary period only, conditioned to read as follows:

The development hereby permitted shall be for a temporary period only, expiring 1 year from the implementation of this permission, the date of which shall be notified to the Local Planning Authority in writing on implementation. Following the expiry of 1 year from implementation, this permission shall cease to have effect.

Reason: Notwithstanding the Environmental Noise Survey Report and Noise Impact Assessment for Extended Lorry Deliveries dated October 2012 as clarified by email from Alastair Close dated 11 April 2013 and advice on this Report from the Council's Environmental Health Officer, the Council remains concerned that the arrival and departure of delivery vehicles during the extended delivery times could unduly impact on the amenity of adjacent residential occupants, particularly of nos. 8, 9, 10 and 11 Nursery Walk, which are in close proximity to the loading bay and may, in particular, be awoken from such deliveries during the extended delivery hour times. The permission granted is therefore for a temporary period only to allow the Council to consider the extent of any additional harm arising as a result of the extended hours, with particular reference to any objections or complaints being made from the occupants of the aforementioned properties in Nursery Walk during the extended delivery time period or with reference to a subsequent application for a permanent extension of delivery hours (Cambridge Local Plan policies 3/4 and 4/13).

13/33/PLAN General Items

13/33/PLANa Application for Addenbrooke's Energy Innovation Centre - County Consultation response

The Committee received consultation response on Cambridgeshire County Council planning application ref: C/05009/12/C.

Proposal: Erection of Energy Innovation Centre (EIC) of 2,675sqm GEA as part of the wider expansion of Addenbrooke's Hospital to form part of the Cambridge Biomedical Campus authorised under planning application ref:06/0796/OUT (Cambridge City Council), replacing the existing Addenbrooke's boiler house. The EIC centre, as an energy from waste facility, incorporates clinical waste incineration generating electricity and heat; two gas-fired Combined Heat and Power units generating electricity and heat; and three dual fuel (oil and gas) conventional steam boilers, to be located to the south west of Addenbrooke's Hospital between Robinson Way and Addenbrooke's Road. Construction of an underground tunnel connecting the energy centre to the existing Addenbrooke's Hospital for the transportation of clinical waste.

Location: South West of Addenbrooke's Road, between Robinson Way and Addenbrooke's Road, Cambridge.

The New Neighbourhoods Principal Planner introduced the report.

The Committee received a representation from Councillor Swanson in her capacity as Ward Councillor for Queen Edith's and as Executive Councillor for Environmental and Waste Services.

The representation covered the following issues:

- i. Particulate emission was a cause for concern.
- ii. Increasing the height of the chimneys would help.
- iii. Every additional meter would make a difference to emissions levels.

It was agreed that condition 7 of Appendix One should be amended as follows, additional word in bold and underlined:

Chimney Height

7. The Chimney height shall be **a minimum** 60m height above finished ground level.

The Committee:

Resolved (7 Votes to 0 and 1 abstention) to accept the officer recommendation and to approve the appended recommendations as follows:

- i. That the County Council be advised that the City Council raise no objection in principle to the planning application but would recommend

that the following issues are resolved prior to the determination of the application and that planning conditions are added to the planning permission to address the following matters:

ii. Further detailed work:

- The applicant should consider the use of an extensive brown roof* on the building to help deal with water management issues and to help tie the building into the surrounding landscape.
- The tree planting should include larger species than the proposed Betula (Birch) to mitigate the visual impact of the mass of the buildings and of the chimneys. Either Tilia cordata 'Green Spire' (Lime) or Corylus colurna (Hazel) trees are suggested as relatively compact trees, which will attain some height.
- The application should take account of the approved Cambridge Biomedical Campus site wide Nature Conservation Management Plan (September 2010) to identify the protection and monitoring of Protected Species on site, and ecological enhancements are included in the proposals.

** a brown roof is a living roof system with a growing medium which allows local plant species to populate the roof over time to encourage biodiversity.*

- iii. A number of Planning Conditions and informatives are recommended as set out in Appendix 1 of the officers report and subject to the above amendment.

13/33/PLANb 13-0231-FUL 186-188 Histon Road

Councillor Stuart withdrew from the meeting for this item and did not participate in the discussion or decision making.

Councillor Blencowe took the Chair for the consideration of this item.

The Committee received an application for an amendment to the original officer recommendation for demolition of two existing dwelling houses and construction of 12no. flats including land for storage of motorcycles in association with the adjoining motorcycle repair use at 184 Histon Road.

The Committee:

Resolved (unanimously) to accept the officer recommendation to approve planning permission as per the agenda.

13/34/PLAN Restricted Report

The Planning Committee resolved to exclude members of the press and public from the meeting while the Planning Committee considered the item to enable discussion of information which is exempt from public access provisions by virtue of paragraph 5 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) Order 2006 (information in respect of which a claim to legal professional privilege could be maintained in legal proceedings).

**13/34/PLANa 32/38 Station Road, Cambridge - Applications ref.
12/0496/CAC, 12/0502/FUL, 12/1553/CAC and 12/1556/FUL - Planning
Appeal - Public Inquiry Update**

The Planning Committee considered information relating to planning application numbers: 12/0496/CAC, 12/0502/FUL, 12/1553/CAC and 12/1556/FUL and the related Planning Inspectorate Appeal References: APP/Q0505/A/13/2191482, APP/Q0505/E/13/2191474, APP/Q0505/A/13/2196604, APP/Q0505/E/13/2196639.

The Committee:

Resolved (by 3 votes to 3 and on the Chair's casting vote) to reject the officer recommendation to confirm that they wish to continue to defend all four appeals.

Resolved (by 3 votes to 2 and one abstention) Not to offer any evidence in support of the reasons for refusal of the planning applications and not to defend the planning appeals relating to APP/Q0505/A/13/2191482, APP/Q0505/E/13/2191474, APP/Q0505/A/13/2196604, APP/Q0505/E/13/2196639 at the public inquiry and to instruct officers to seek to agree a deferral of the Public Inquiry dates with the Appellants to allow further applications for planning permission and conservation area consent to

be determined. The Planning Committee considered that having taken into account all relevant matters including legal advice, the prospects of success in defending the planning appeals at the Public Inquiry were low.

The meeting ended at 2.25 pm

CHAIR